

# Math Has This Funny Property

Zachary Abel<sup>†</sup>

Harvard University '10

Cambridge, MA 02138

zabel@fas.harvard.edu

Scott D. Kominers<sup>†</sup>

Harvard University '09

Cambridge, MA 02138

kominers@fas.harvard.edu

Our Mathematical Minutiae article, “*i* Has This Funny Property” (this *HCMR*, p. 75), details the analytic power of the complex numbers  $\mathbb{C}$ . Once we adjoin a single square root of  $-1$  to the real numbers  $\mathbb{R}$ , we obtain startling results: Cauchy’s Theorem, Liouville’s Theorem, The Cauchy Integral Formula. . .

But if we add just a few more square roots of  $-1$  to obtain the **quaternions**  $\mathbb{H} \supset \mathbb{C}$ , some of the underlying structure breaks down. In the standard presentation, the roots  $\{i, j, k\}$  of  $-1$  do not even commute:

$$ij = k = -ji, \quad jk = i = -kj, \quad ik = -j = -ki.$$

Since  $\mathbb{H}$  is not commutative, it is not necessarily true that  $[q(z)]^n$  is “ $\mathbb{H}$ -analytic” when  $q(z)$  is. Thus, we figured, *everything should break down once we pass from  $\mathbb{C}$  to  $\mathbb{H}$ .*

---

The endpaper would be called “*j* and *k* Have This Funny Property.” We would give all the standard counterexamples from quaternionic analysis, proving in a tour-de-force of mathematical irony how two new roots could devolve the entire analytic system of  $\mathbb{C}$  below its foundations.

We raced to the references. We read. We re-read. We—

We were wrong.

No counterexamples. In the late 1930s, Fueter obtained quaternionic analogues of Cauchy’s Theorem, Liouville’s Theorem, and even of power series developments. Our ironic tour-de-force was ruined before we were even born.

---

We despaired, until we thought to add four more square roots of  $-1$  to obtain the **octonions**  $\mathbb{O} \supset \mathbb{H} \supset \mathbb{C}$ . We thought, *this extension of  $\mathbb{C}$  is not even associative—there is no way octonionic analysis could be well-behaved!*

We raced to the references. We read. We—

Math is funny like that.

---

<sup>†</sup> See biographical information in this *HCMR*, p. 75.